



S U S T A I N A B L E  
D E V E L O P M E N T

# Education for Sustainable Development – Learning to create quality of life

**The Fourth Annual Report of the  
Sustainable Development Education Panel**

January 2002

Education for Sustainable Development –  
Learning to create quality of life

**The Fourth Annual Report of the  
Sustainable Development Education Panel**

January 2002

Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs

Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs  
Nobel House  
17 Smith Square  
London SW1P 5DU  
Telephone 020 7238 6000  
Internet service [www.defra.gov.uk/](http://www.defra.gov.uk/)

© Crown Copyright 2002

*Copyright in the typographical arrangement and design rests with the Crown.*

*This publication (excluding the logo) may be reproduced free of charge in any format or medium provided that it is reproduced accurately and not used in a misleading context. The material must be acknowledged as Crown copyright with the title and source of the publication specified.*

Further copies of this report are available from:

DEFRA Publications  
Admail 6000  
London  
SW1A 2XX  
Tel: 0845 9556 000

This document is also available on the DEFRA website.

Published by the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs. Printed in the UK, January 2002, on material containing 75% post consumer waste and 25% ECF pulp (cover) and 100% post-consumer waste (text).

Product code PB 6417

# CONTENTS

Introduction	5
Our achievements in 2001	5
Central Government	5
Regional and Local Government	6
Schools	6
Further and Higher Education	7
Professions and the Workplace	7
Youth Services	9
Recommendation and Priorities for Our Fifth Year	9
Strategic Direction for Learning and Skills Councils	9
Sector Guides on Education for Sustainable Development	10
Life Skills for a Sustainable Future	10
Informal Learning	11
Other Recommendations	12
Obstacles, Drivers, and Opportunities	13
Obstacles to Change	13
Drivers for Change	14
Opportunities for Change	16
Glossary	17
<b>APPENDIX A</b>	
Summary of New Recommendations and Further Action	18
<b>APPENDIX B</b>	
Summary of Previous Recommendations in the Panel's Public Reports	20
<b>APPENDIX C</b>	
About the Sustainable Development Education Panel	30

# Introduction

1. We would first like to pay tribute to all organisations actively working to deliver Education for Sustainable Development (ESD). We were created specifically to promote a strategic approach, developing a broad view of ESD across a range of sectors, and suggesting to those others how they can position their own contribution to the best advantage of the shared strategic vision<sup>1</sup>. We strive to be a valued partner in developing ESD strategies and initiatives. We can make connections across a broad range of interest and specialism. We can devise frameworks around which specific ESD initiatives can be built. We can generate ideas and provoke debate to stimulate those closer to the ESD front line. Where appropriate we can make specific recommendations to governments and others on principles, policies and programmes that may help to focus and attain this vision. In short, our most useful role is to catalyse effective action by others.

## Our achievements in 2001<sup>2</sup>

2. We begin by revisiting our previous recommendations. Table 1 of Appendix B summarises, by subject, the action to which our 55 recommendations have led, while Table 2 sets out both recommendations and action taken. Overall 25% of our recommendations have been wholly, and a further 47% partly, achieved. We have achieved a greater proportion of our third year's recommendations than of our first. We can report considerable impact across sectors for which we made recommendations, greatest of all for central government. We have had a fairly high impact on regional and local government sectors, with some success in schools, in further and higher education and in youth service, and rather less in relation to professions, the workplace, and the general public. In the following pages we will analyse the reasons for this pattern, identifying important obstacles and opportunities.
3. We have learned from the process of making recommendations to others. We have found out from experience that recommendations need to be free of any possible ambiguity, directed at specific stakeholders, and brought before those stakeholders boldly and regularly. We believe a higher proportion of our third year recommendations have been wholly or partly achieved because more had these qualities.

### **CENTRAL GOVERNMENT**

4. Top level recognition of our role, direct contact with Ministers and the presence of a high level forum (the Green Ministers) have helped make central government the sector where our recommendations have been most acted upon. We expected this, as Government brought us into being, and we report to it. We have met Ministers of Department for Education and Skills (DfES) and the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs (DEFRA) on two occasions to discuss the analysis and advice in our Third Report.
5. The General Election and subsequent changes to government departments and Ministers have interrupted our work with them and the bodies they control. This has delayed the fulfilment of a long-standing invitation from the Green Ministers Committee to us to

<sup>1</sup> Our terms of reference and membership are given fully at Appendix C.

<sup>2</sup> The background to these recommendations is set out in the sector analysis of our Third Report, available at <http://www.defra.gov.uk/environment/sustainable/educpanel/2000ar/04.htm>.

explore our work with them. We look forward to meeting the new Green Ministers in 2002 and to discussing how government departments can engage further in ESD, including the further development of champions for sustainable development. We shall turn to the implications of the creation of DEFRA in paragraph 43 below.

6. Our Chairman has also met the Chairman of the Sustainable Development Commission. The discussion encompassed the work plans of the two advisory bodies and explored how best to avoid overlap and to ensure co-operative working. The Commission showed particular interest in our research *Towards a Language for Sustainable Development*<sup>3</sup>. We plan to engage further with the Commission to discuss the relationship between their developing work programme and our own, particularly in the light of the education recommendations of their recent *Vision for Sustainable Agriculture*<sup>4</sup>, and their work in relation to Communicating Sustainable Development and with the Business and Central Government sectors.

## REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT

7. We have been encouraged by the interest that some Regional Development Agencies (RDAs) have taken in education for sustainable development, including the Yorkshire and Humber Regional Sustainable Development Education Strategy which regional agencies developed, with our support. However we have identified scope for RDAs as a whole to better assign responsibility and develop capacity for education for sustainable development in their strategies and programmes. Ministers have offered to facilitate a meeting between members of RDAs and ourselves to discuss this further, and we intend to avail ourselves of this opportunity in the coming year.
8. In our Third Report we recommended that all local authorities *should develop strategies for ESD as an integral part of overall plans, taking full account of existing good practice and local response to nationally led developments such as ESD in the National Curriculum*<sup>5</sup>. In the light of our analysis, we consider **that it would now be timely for the Local Government Association to review the sector's achievements and plans for sustainable development and, within that context, ESD, before the World Summit on Sustainable Development which takes place later in 2002.** This could bring together the new powers for local authorities to promote the social, economic and environmental well being of their area, the new duty to prepare community strategies, and the Best Value initiative.
9. We have also met representatives of the Health Development Agency, whose role is to reduce inequality of health between the wealthy and least well off. As a result we were invited to talk to their regional arms about a pilot regional project, which could explore the scope for links with ESD across a range of initiatives such as Healthy Schools, Health Action Zones, and health issues in further and higher education institutions.

## SCHOOLS

10. We know that our submission to the National Curriculum Review was influential in bringing about the enhanced status that ESD now enjoys in the National Curriculum. We welcome the further coverage of aspects of ESD as Citizenship becomes a national

<sup>3</sup> Available at <http://www.defra.gov.uk/environment/sustainable/language/index.htm>

<sup>4</sup> Available at <http://www.sd-commission.gov.uk/pubs/food2001/index.htm>

<sup>5</sup> Third Report, paragraph 29, available at <http://www.defra.gov.uk/environment/sustainable/educpanel/2000ar/04.htm#02>

curriculum subject for pupils in all year groups at key stage 3 and 4 from August 2002. We look to schools and local education authorities to ensure that this is introduced in a way that enhances the links to other subjects that carry ESD in the curriculum such as Science and Geography.

11. We continue to help both OFSTED and the Teacher Training Agency (TTA) address ESD. We regard continuing professional development as a significant means to developing ESD in schools, particularly through the National College for School Leadership and its Leadership and Management Programme for New Headteachers.
12. Our members have contributed to the development of **on-line support** for teachers on sustainable development in the National Curriculum that DfES has commissioned from the Qualifications and Curriculum Authority. The first phase has now been published at <http://www.nc.uk.net/esd>. We look forward to this becoming an increasingly important first point of call for teachers wishing to develop their understanding of and skills in ESD. We encourage DfES to seek out and take up other educational opportunities relevant to sustainable development, such as the 2002 Johannesburg World Summit, which is relevant to both the Citizenship and to wider ESD curricula.

### **FURTHER AND HIGHER EDUCATION**

13. We have continued to be involved in stimulating interest and actions in ESD within the post-16 sector as well as the wider ranging Life Skills project described at paragraph 33 below.
14. In late 2000 the Further Education Funding Council (FEFC) funded eleven small-scale sustainable development education Standards Fund projects, managed by the Learning and Skills Development Agency (LSDA). The aims of this FEFC/LSC (Learning and Skills Council) Sustainable Development Education Initiative included identifying and sharing existing good practice, preparing illustrative studies and exploring the scope and priority areas for improvement. LSDA plans to publish a full project report in 2002 and the LSC will offer further support from the Standards Fund in 2001/02.
15. We welcome the LSDA's planned initiative to extend interest and debate on the ESD via a series of seminars planned for the spring of 2002 entitled *Learning to Last: Skills, Sustainability and Strategy*. This will be followed by the launch in September 2002 of the seminar papers and findings covering *Citizenship and Social Inclusion; Education for Sustainable Economic Development; and Responsibility in Education in a Risk Society*.
16. We also welcome the commitment that the University for Industry has now made to sustainable development and is developing materials in the areas of: Sustainable Development for All; Your Business and the Environment; and Farm Sustainability. The courses will become available to learners online in the New Year.

### **PROFESSIONS AND THE WORKPLACE**

17. Over the past year, a number of changes affecting learning in the workplace have encouraged us to reflect upon our earlier recommendations, particularly in relation to Professions and the Workplace. In partnership with the Advisory Committee on Business and the Environment (ACBE) and the Trades Union Sustainable Development Advisory Committee (TUSDAC), we made representations to DfES about its consultation on National Training Organisations (NTOs). We wrote again supporting the idea of an

“expert unit” on sustainable development to provide expertise and quality assurance and promote sector-based champions. We are pleased that DfES’s recent policy document *Meeting the Sector Skills Productivity Challenge*<sup>6</sup> states that it will give the new Sector Skills Development Agency an advisory role on sustainable development in respect of the Sector Skills Councils which will replace the NTOs, and Ministers have invited us to work with DfES officials on this.

18. In addition to the new Sector Skills Councils that will focus learning to match the needs of particular sectors, the Learning and Skills Councils are now in place, with targets to develop workplace learning initiatives. Alongside these important new vehicles for sustainable development learning are others such as: the Work/Life Balance initiative, Learning Representatives within the Trades Unions (and the role of Trades Unions generally via TUSDAC) and the expansion of learndirect (the University for Industry). This network of new and established bodies provides a tremendous opportunity for positive and concerted action in the workplace to support learning for sustainable development.
19. Coupled with a shift in workplace learning opportunities we are seeing signs that professions too are taking an increasing interest in their role in delivering a sustainable future through continuous professional development programmes. Given the prominent role that professionals have in business decision making to drive forward change, they need to be encouraged and supported in their efforts to become more sustainable. This will require support from government departments and others already prominently placed to influence the wide range of professional bodies that exist, in learning more about sustainable development and putting this into action.
20. Once such intermediary is the Council For Excellence in Management Leadership, which we exhort to include ESD as a key part of integrated management and leadership programmes, particularly with reference to planned development work with SMEs and professions. We would further ask them to bring their influence to bear on the inclusion of ESD in the direct responsibility of the Small Business Service. We also welcome the DTI’s wider initiative to co-ordinate management development signposting into a continuous ladder of progression linked to learndirect and the development of the e-University.
21. We are keen to ensure that access to sustainable development learning in the workplace is appropriate, flexible and easy. Some people will start from a prior knowledge of environmental or development issues, others from issues around health and safety, others still from motivations to improve their bottom line economic performance. All present an opportunity for wider learning around sustainable development that should be exploited fully.
22. Our sector guides to assist those wishing to engage further with the sustainable development education agenda (see paragraph 31 below) are particularly relevant to the world of work and the professions. The guides are intended to provide some help on where to start, the process for moving forward, and where support might be accessed.
23. Last year we reported that Quadrangle had just completed a study for us of the opportunities that might be created by an **Investors in Sustainable Development** (IiSD) workplace award or standard. We have published this research at <http://www.defra.gov.uk/environment/sustainable/educpanel/investors/index.htm>. Quadrangle’s conclusion was that the time was not yet right for an IiSD scheme to be

<sup>6</sup> Available at <http://www.dfes.gov.uk/sectorskills/>

pursued, but that existing awards and standards could be amended to make more provision for the recognition of education for sustainable development. We are disappointed that our proposed initiative is so far ahead of its time, but we accept that, at present, efforts to embed ESD in existing awards and standards have the potential to do far more to educate employers about sustainable development, and that this could have further-reaching and more cost-effective results than establishing a new standard.

## **YOUTH SERVICES**

24. All the recommendations that we have made for youth work are still in the process of implementation in this diverse sector. Much will depend on how the DfES, with the field, carries forward its proposals in the consultation document *Transforming Youth Work*. We are aware of dialogue that the Council for Environmental Education, the Development Education Association and the National Youth Agency have begun with DfES's Connexions Unit on incorporating sustainable development into the training of Connexions personal advisors.

## Recommendation and Priorities for Our Fifth Year

25. Having reviewed our work in each sector, we shall now move on to set out our programme of work for 2002. This will be our fifth year, the last before the quinquennial review required of all Non Departmental Public Bodies. Our work will focus on four topics: the opportunities offered by the creation of the Learning and Skills Council network; our proposal to develop sector specific guides; the next phase of our work on Life Skills; and the potential of informal learning as a conduit for ESD. We will include recommendations for these, where appropriate.

## **STRATEGIC DIRECTION FOR LEARNING AND SKILLS COUNCILS**

26. The national Learning and Skills Council (LSC) and its 47 local arms are key agents for change in the post-16 sector, with great potential to spread ESD across formal and informal learning in educational institutions and the workplace.
27. Another major role for LSCs is targeting local initiative and European funding. Existing FEFC/LSC Standards Fund Projects already show how modest funding can stimulate ESD activity. Proposals for post-16 Centres of Vocational Excellence afford further opportunities to reinforce ESD targets and practice in the post-16 sectors. Extending Standard Funding could speed up staff upskilling and curriculum development in association with the Further Education National Training Organisation (FENTO) or its successor.
28. At present a complex network of funding sources uses a variety of local level indicators to justify success. LSCs are finding it hard to establish a baseline against which to determine the added value in the ESD projects they support. Even where they can establish it, they lack agreed qualitative and quantitative indicators with which to assess progress made by projects, which hinders progress at a local level. There is a specific shortage of expertise to judge the value of work based/vocational projects with environmental, social and economic outputs. We have identified unrealised potential for a read-across between the

LSCs' need for effective evaluation of ESD projects, and academic research such as that of the Centre for Research on the Wider Benefits of Learning<sup>7</sup>. More broadly, staff simply lack the necessary training and briefing in ESD and its relevance within the regional planning framework.

29. Building ESD into the skills, participation and overarching learning strategies of the LSC framework could help to link outputs to regional and national headline indicators for sustainable development. This strategic approach could include the regional impact of higher education institutions. New inspection arrangements afford an opportunity via OFSTED and Adult Learning Inspectorate to enforce standards in ESD and practice within the LSC strategic framework.

### **RECOMMENDATION AND ACTION ON LEARNING AND SKILLS COUNCILS**

30. *We will discuss with LSC and LSDA how best to promote greater understanding of ESD within further education and lifelong and informal learning, which may well involve developing guidelines with examples of practice.*

### **SECTOR GUIDES ON EDUCATION FOR SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT**

31. Progress on ESD is least clear and uniform in sectors characterised by a large proportion of relatively small, comparatively under-regulated organisations, which are frequently competitive, and which value their independence. The workplace is a stark example; with a number of small and medium sized business enterprises, NTOs, trade associations, trade unions and professions displaying many of these characteristics.
32. We have received a number of requests for simple, specific, guidance for sectors of this kind, where institutions may be warm to the need for ESD but uncertain of how to proceed. In response we have developed a model for a series of sector guidance documents on ESD. In the coming year we will work with TUSDAC to adapt this model to the trades union sector. We hope, in due course, to publish the model, together with this exemplar, for other sectors to customise for their own use. We expect this tool to complement existing advice such as the Sigma Project, ACBE's *Value, Growth, Success – How Sustainable Is Your Business?* and the Professional Practice for Sustainable Development Programme. Ministers have expressed an interest in helping disseminate the results of this work.

### **LIFE SKILLS FOR A SUSTAINABLE FUTURE**

33. This project, which we conceived in 1999, makes links between post-16 education and the social inclusion and citizenship agendas. It can be widely applied within and beyond FE to promote the learning of those currently least engaged in education. DfES has consulted on it. The 84 responses to the document included national bodies and key agencies, as well as colleges and individuals. The majority were highly supportive. The report generated additional interest from agencies, particularly colleges, who were running or proposed to run courses related to our ideas. Having analysed these responses, we met with practitioners and other experts earlier this year to explore how to take this forward.
34. The resulting projects included a tutor curriculum development pack; ICT (Information and Computer Technology) specific exemplar projects, to promote ESD's knowledge

<sup>7</sup> Details available at <http://www.learningbenefits.net>

elements; healthy living safety and responsibility exemplar projects; best practice exemplars from existing urban and rural regeneration projects; a project to support supporters, parents and other adults working with young people and mentor qualifications to support further guidance and training and perhaps a qualification for tutors.

## **RECOMMENDATIONS ON LIFE SKILLS FOR A SUSTAINABLE FUTURE**

35. *We will approach the following agencies and recommend they take forward work in this area:*
- a. *University for Industry (Ufi)/learndirect to take forward curriculum framework development and a tutors training pack.*
  - b. *LANTRA or its successor to consider developing knowledge-based ICT packages as part of their hub developments.*
  - c. *Higher Education Funding Council for England to support ESD knowledge based materials as specific projects, in association with the roll out of Foundation degrees. Ideally these should be ICT based projects.*
36. *We are keen to extend the awareness of ESD to tutors working in adult education and Ufi/learndirect programmes. We aim, therefore, to approach learndirect to encourage them to develop the Life Skills for a Sustainable Future module as an IT based tutors' pack.*

## **INFORMAL LEARNING**

37. Many learning opportunities are informal, though their nature and impact are more difficult to identify because they often occur outside a recognised educational setting. Informal learning takes place whenever a person of any age gains knowledge, skill, understanding or a deepening of values. This can happen through, for example, copying or coaching, by reading or watching television, visiting museums and other visitor attractions, through hobbies like DIY and gardening, or by having to act in a crisis. In such situations the learner's motivation is high and what is learned often has a real, practical and immediate impact.
38. We believe that informal learning is an area of current thinking about sustainable development education with unrealised potential to make an impact on the quality of all of our lives. For this to be successful it needs to be both embedded within wider agendas and tailored to specific settings, such as libraries, museums, sports clubs, or faith institutions. Where public awareness raising on a broader front is used, it needs simple messages and endorsement by well-known personalities if it is to catch the public eye. This will need more appealing straplines than "sustainable development" and could make far more effective use of the national and regional Quality of Life indicators.
39. We are now exploring this agenda with the Department for Culture, Media and Sport (DCMS) Ministers, the Sustainable Development Commission and DfES's Director of Adult Learning, and have commended to Government *A Manifesto for Family Learning*<sup>8</sup> developed by a partnership of non governmental organisations. We hope to be in a

<sup>8</sup> Campaign for Learning/CEDC/Education Extra/NIACE/Scottish Education Manifesto for Family Learning, Southgate Publishing, September 2000, £5.00

position to make recommendations on this important area in our Fifth Report. Meanwhile we would like to hear from practitioners and experts how best they feel informal learning can engage with ESD content.

### **RECOMMENDATION ON INFORMAL LEARNING**

40. *We recommend that the Government consider how its Quality of Life indicators can be a tool for informal learning through a range of government initiatives in the social inclusion agenda such as Neighbourhood Renewal.*

### **OTHER RECOMMENDATIONS**

41. DfES is responsible for a range of sectors, from pre-school to further and higher education, and workforce development and adult learning, all of which have social, regional, environmental and economic impacts on wider society, making sustainable development a key linking theme to its own management. It also manages a group of bodies such as the LSC, the QCA, the Funding Councils, and the New Deal and the Skills Task Forces which need to provide advice on ESD to their clients. DfES also plans to create further bodies, such as the Sector Skills Development Agency. It is therefore faced with the need to provide advice on sustainable development, and education for sustainable development, to an increasing range of often new bodies with limited skills and experience in this area, as well as advice for its own staff and agencies. Faced with similar needs, DEFRA, DTLR and the Department for Trade and Industry have found it helpful to create specialist units of expertise on sustainable development. These have also proved useful support for Green Ministers in those departments and in the sustainable development education of their own staff.
42. In view of the increasing need for expertise in this area, *we recommend that DfES creates an advice unit on ESD, and that this be adequately resourced. Its purpose would include:*
  - a. *Serving as a central source of advice and support for DfES Ministers (including the Green Minister), staff and agencies in relation to the development and evaluation of DfES policies and programmes in improving the resource productivity and sustainability of the Department and its agencies;*
  - b. *Helping DfES's executive agencies, task forces, advisors and Non Departmental Public Bodies take appropriate account of sustainable development issues;*
  - c. *Providing advice and support to the LSC and local LSCs in the development of national and regional strategy for ESD education;*
  - d. *Assisting the Inspectorates with the incorporation of ESD standards into the Common Inspection Framework;*
  - e. *Publicising best practice at national level and liaising with DEFRA and other government departments to co-ordinate ESD policy initiatives nationally;*
  - f. *Encouraging DfES's own staff and those in its sponsored bodies to develop further the use they make of existing sources of professional and voluntary sector expertise in sustainable development and ESD.*

43. The creation of DEFRA, brigading the government's Sustainable Development Strategy alongside farming, countryside, biodiversity and rural community matters, presents challenges and opportunities. One challenge is that sustainable development is seen by some as the responsibility of a purely rural department, and this could reinforce the stereotyping of sustainable development as being just about the environment, even though the Secretary of State has stated clearly that she does not wish her department to be seen as solely, or as the sole department, responsible for the countryside. DEFRA's creation also provides the opportunity for Ministers to bring together rural and urban interests, helping to develop a strategic approach to ESD, provided that DEFRA works closely with the Department for Transport, Local Government and the Regions and with RDAs on urban and rural regeneration, community strategies, neighbourhood renewal and public space policies. We expect to make recommendations on this important area in our Fifth Report, having discussed the subject first with both DEFRA Ministers and the SDC.

## Obstacles, Drivers, and Opportunities

44. Our Panel has now been in existence long enough for us to be able to draw conclusions about what will really carry forward awareness of, and learning about, sustainable development. We again stress that our role is to take a strategic overview and, at carefully selected points, to provoke particular actions by those who have key responsibility or who are vital intermediaries. As our Panel reaches the end of its first allotted span – five years – we believe it will be helpful to Government and others if we set out the major lessons we have learned so far and the major opportunities which lie ahead.

### OBSTACLES TO CHANGE

45. There are a number of significant obstacles to bringing about the changes that we all wish to see.
- a. A **lack of capacity** in both formal and informal education systems to support awareness for, and learning about, sustainable development. Taking forward the agenda of sustainable development needs skilled practitioners from all walks of life, such as the youth worker who can capture an idea on the wing with a group of young people concerned about their local environment; or the skilled amateur in a faith-based group or in the workplace who can help make connections between neighbourhood issues and globalisation. Moreover, for learning to thrive it often needs support beyond the level of the individual practitioner: it requires those willing to champion it at the highest level in the institution's planning and governance. These roles place demands on human resources, and require, in particular, action by HE institutions to improve the understanding and skills of educators. We drew attention to these needs in previous reports. Last year, for example, we suggested a range of actions for the TTA, for NTOs and professions, and for Universities UK. We are pleased to see the LSDA making a start in respect of FE but much more needs to be done and government, especially the DfES, should give a stronger lead to the bodies within its aegis.
  - b. We commissioned the Charities Aid Foundation to research and make recommendations on sources of support for ESD. Having consulted a range of potential funding bodies, they found very few that were specific to ESD. Even where organisations believed themselves to be funding ESD, on closer investigation this often proved to be environmental education. The consultants identified a clear need

to raise awareness and understanding of ESD among funders, and this is one purpose that our proposed sector guides (see paragraph 31 above) could serve. We are aware that the Council for Environmental Education and the Development Education Association are in discussion with a number of trusts and foundations about developing a strategy on how they can develop better models of support for ESD. The other research project we undertook – Investors in Sustainable Development – is described in paragraph 23 above.

- c. There is an **absence of a positive vision** and the routes to achieving it at any level, and its replacement by negative images or negative statements designed to alarm but resulting only in depression, denial and a turning away from what is possible. There is a hunger for clear and consistent messages from Government and others. The Prime Minister's two recent speeches<sup>9</sup> began to meet this gap, but were mainly reported in specialist media to those already sensitised and committed.
- d. Linked to this are **fatalism and feelings of helplessness** – a belief that whatever one individual, one community or one organisation does can make little difference to human deprivation and environmental degradation. The Government has attempted to overcome this with the *are you doing your bit* campaign but clearer and better resourced messages are needed, consistently reinforced across Government.
- e. The **short term driving out longer term considerations**, with an emphasis in many sectors on immediate targets at the expense of enduring achievements. For example it is instructive to compare the attention devoted by industry, media and Government to the effects of the 11 September outrages on the aviation and tourism industries, to that given to the sustainable development implications of tourism and aviation over the same period.
- f. Sustainable development is all too often **compartmentalised** either by separating out responsibility for its components, or by making it the sole concern of a specialised unit or person. There is a value in such people (who we call champions) or units as centres of expertise (indeed we now recommend one for DfES), but, unless used properly, they may lead to others feeling that they have no responsibilities for sustainable development in their organisation or community. All levels and disciplines within any organisation need to learn about it, what it looks like and how to do it, and not least within Government policy making.

## DRIVERS FOR CHANGE

46. If the obstacles to change are clear, so, too, are the drivers. The major drivers for change are awareness of the public that sustainable development matters, that there is a need for action, and that everyone has a part to play. That awareness can, in turn, be stimulated and supported by the requirements of regulatory bodies.
47. Within those general statements, there are at least four particularly important drivers for change. These are:
  - a. **Crises, national or local.** In the last eighteen months there have been at least four crises which have heightened awareness of the significance of sustainable development

<sup>9</sup> Richer and Greener on 24 October 2000 (available at <http://www.number-10.gov.uk/news>) and Environment: The Next Steps of 6 March 2001 (available at <http://www.number10.gov.uk/news>)

and have led to many more people being aware of its importance. These were, in chronological order, the petrol blockade in the summer of 2000; the floods of the autumn and winter of 2000/2001; the transport crisis following the Hatfield rail crash; and throughout most of 2001 the foot and mouth crisis. More recently, the events of 11 September in New York and Washington have made many more people aware of East/West inequalities, and varying experiences and conflicting perceptions of different communities within England.

- b. Crises such as these provide a salutary, if unwelcome, challenge to conventional ways of behaving, and Ministers and others need to build on all of these events, which have undoubtedly provided opportunities for both informal and formal learning about SD. One of the challenges is to make the connection between these life-changing events and the less than universally recognised and understood term 'sustainable development'. The Prime Minister's speech *The Power of Community Can Change The World* at this year's Labour Party conference<sup>10</sup> began this process. However there is more to do to express this vision to those working in education for sustainable development, and to incorporate in that vision less immediate but deep feelings such as anxiety about the origin and safety of the food we eat; worry about loss of biodiversity; unease as to the impact of global warming; and apprehension about greater economic integration with our European partners.
- c. The second driver for change is the group of **Green Ministers**. They must play a key part in not only encouraging but requiring their departments and agencies for which those departments are responsible, to deliver systematic programmes for increasing awareness and learning, formal and informal, for their staffs and for their clients and customers. Green Ministers are in a powerful position to provide a consistency of approach, which could act as an antidote to the powerlessness and fatalism we have noted. Their presence then helps to make achievements of aspirations.
- d. Were all relevant Government departments to provide information in parallel, linked by a communication campaign with common threads, sustainable development education, leading to positive action at all levels, would follow. This will be particularly important as, in its second term, the Government sets the policies that it has consulted on and developed into the institutional forms that will deliver them.
- e. A third driver for change is a clear demonstration that sustainable development (awareness, education and practice) can and does lead to **competitive advantage**. Increasingly there are fine examples of this in business and commerce and Ministers and others need to build on them. Some clear examples in the public services, are also emerging as a part of their drive to modernise the public services, Ministers should expect and look for much more.
- f. Fourthly, there is growing recognition of the need to build and rebuild community cohesion, creating social capital through empowering individuals and communities. For this to be achieved, sustainable development needs **champions** in those communities, and, most importantly, networks to support those champions. The Government is starting to acknowledge the need to stimulate leadership in school with its Citizenship programmes, but adults must also be enthused and empowered. At every level and in every kind of organisation, Government, public service, business

<sup>10</sup> Available at <http://www.labour.org.uk/>

and commerce or the voluntary sector, Ministers and others need to ensure that champions are identified and supported, particularly at senior levels within organisations. It is a factor to consider in any appointment.

## **OPPORTUNITIES FOR CHANGE**

48. Our major message however is that there are some very large opportunities indeed in the immediate future and we hope that Ministers and others will seize them and act upon them. Here are some of the more immediate:
  - a. The Government's approach at all levels to neighbourhood renewal, to local strategic partnership and the new structures coming into existence to support those policies, not least the arrival of LSCs and the requirement on them to analyse local needs and provide for them. Sustainable development should always be an objective of and an output for such action. In this whole area there are very big opportunities in the next twelve months and it is important that the country does not miss them.
  - b. The major programme of refurbishment of fabric of the formal education system, particularly schools. The £8.3 billion programme on which the Government has embarked provides a not to be missed opportunity to create sustainable buildings and systems and to introduce sustainable work practices.
  - c. The reform of the Common Agricultural Policy and, not least, new approaches to policy towards, and development in, the countryside and food production presents an opportunity to refocus practices through a concerted programme of training offered via those who provide first hand advice to rural businesses, especially farming.
  - d. The continuing transport crises provide an opportunity for major long-term policy making and programme introduction for sustainable and co-ordinated transport systems and for raising public awareness of choice and responsibility and the benefits of change.
  - e. The emphasis on workforce development, whether in the public services or the private sector, provides a major opportunity to push forward learning in the work place, supported by the LSCs and the sector training bodies.
  - f. The introduction of citizenship into the National Curriculum, bringing with it a major opportunity in both the training of new and the continuing professional development of existing teachers; and of the Foundation Stage Curriculum for 3-5 year-olds. with its emphasis on simple, fundamental sustainable development values, attitudes and skills, present major opportunities to develop a broad-based approach to sustainable development education from an early age which we wish to encourage and support.
49. Behind these specific opportunities lie three other ongoing opportunities which could so easily result in a much greater awareness and understanding of sustainable development. These are:
  - a. The greatly enhanced opportunities for developing creativity in young people and a desire of many young people to take advantage of those opportunities.

- b. An ageing population with time to reflect or to participate in educational activities to support sustainable development and to become champions, not least in local communities.
  - c. The arrival and rapid development of digital television, providing the opportunity, perhaps, for a dedicated channel.
50. Overall, we remain optimistic but we need to repeat that it is not our role as a Panel to educate, but rather to encourage others to engage in or support formal and informal sustainable development learning activities. The need for active champions and intermediaries has never been greater and, at the outset of a new Parliament, the key role of Green Ministers cannot be too strongly emphasised. If Green Ministers were to secure that within their Departments, every time a senior appointment is made, it is regarded as an opportunity to identify a champion or to raise expectations of those appointed, a remarkable amount of progress could be made in a very short time.

## Glossary

ACBE	Advisory Committee on Business and The Environment
DCMS	Department of Culture, Media and Sport
DEFRA	Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs
DETR	Department for the Environment, Transport and the Regions
DfEE	Department for Education and Employment
DfES	Department for Education and Skills
ESD	Education for Sustainable Development
FENTO	Further Education National Training Organisation
ICT	Information and Computer Technology
LGMB	Local Government Management Board
LSDA	Learning and Skills Development Agency
NTO	National Training Organisation
QCA	Qualifications and Curriculum Authority
RDA	Regional Development Agency
TTA	Teacher Training Agency
TUSDAC	Trades Union Sustainable Development Advisory Committee

## APPENDIX A

# Summary of New Recommendations and Further Action

### RECOMMENDATION FOR CENTRAL GOVERNMENT (PARAGRAPH 42)

1. In view of the increasing need for expertise in this area, we recommend that DfES creates an advice unit on ESD, and that this be adequately resourced. Its purpose would include:
  - a. Serving as a central source of advice and support for DfES Ministers (including the Green Minister), staff and agencies in relation to the development and evaluation of DfES policies and programmes in improving the resource productivity and sustainability of the Department and its agencies;
  - b. Helping DfES's executive agencies, task forces, advisors and Non Departmental Public Bodies take appropriate account of sustainable development issues;
  - c. Providing advice and support to the LSC and local LSCs in the development of national and regional strategy for ESD education;
  - d. Assisting the Inspectorates with the incorporation of ESD standards into the Common Inspection Framework;
  - e. Publicising best practice at national level and liaising with DEFRA and other government departments to co-ordinate ESD policy initiatives nationally;
  - f. Encouraging DfES's own staff and those in its sponsored bodies to develop further the use they make of existing sources of professional and voluntary sector expertise in sustainable development and ESD.

### RECOMMENDATION FOR LOCAL GOVERNMENT (PARAGRAPH 8)

2. We recommend that it would now be timely for the Local Government Association to review the sector's achievements and plans for sustainable development and, within that context, ESD, before the World Summit on Sustainable Development later in 2002.

### RECOMMENDATION AND ACTION FOR LEARNING AND SKILLS COUNCILS (PARAGRAPH 30)

3. We will discuss with LSC and LSDA how best to promote greater understanding of ESD within further education and lifelong and informal learning, which may well involve developing guidelines with examples of practice.

**RECOMMENDATIONS AND ACTION ON LIFE SKILLS FOR A SUSTAINABLE FUTURE (PARAGRAPHS 35-6)**

4. We will approach the following agencies and recommend they take forward work in this area:
  - a. University for Industry (Ufi)/learndirect to take forward curriculum framework development and a tutors training pack.
  - b. LANTRA or its successor to consider developing knowledge-based ICT packages as part of their hub developments.
  - c. Higher Education Funding Council for England to support ESD knowledge based materials as specific projects, in association with the roll out of Foundation degrees. Ideally these should be ICT based projects.
5. We are keen to extend the awareness of ESD to tutors working in adult education and Ufi/learndirect programmes. We therefore aim to approach learndirect to encourage them to develop the Life Skills for a Sustainable Future module as an IT based tutors pack.

**RECOMMENDATION ON INFORMAL LEARNING (PARAGRAPH 40)**

6. We recommend that the Government consider how its Quality of Life indicators can be a tool for informal learning through a range of government initiatives in the social inclusion agenda such as Neighbourhood Renewal.

## APPENDIX B

# Summary of Previous Recommendations in the Panel's Public Reports

**Table 1: Summary of action taken on Panel recommendations, number and percentage of recommendations in each report achieved by subject area**

	First Report				Third Report				All Reports			
	Wholly Achieved	Partly Achieved	Not achieved	% Wholly or Partly Achieved	Wholly Achieved	Partly Achieved	Not achieved	% Wholly or Partly Achieved	Wholly Achieved	Partly Achieved	Not achieved	% Wholly or Partly Achieved
Central Government	3	0	0	100%	1	3	0	100%	4	3	0	100%
Regional/Local Government	1	2	0	100%	1	2	0	100%	2	4	0	100%
Schools	1	2	2	60%	0	5	1	83%	1	7	3	73%
Further & Higher Education	1	1	0	100%	1	4	2	71%	2	4	3	67%
Professions	0	0	0	n/a	0	3	2	40%	0	3	2	60%
Workplace	2	0	3	40%	0	0	0	n/a	2	0	3	40%
Youth Services	1	2	0	50%	1	0	0	100%	2	2	0	100%
General Public	1	0	4	20%	0	2	1	66%	1	2	5	38%
TOTAL	10	7	9	65%	4	19	6	79%	14	26	15	73%

Table 2: Action taken on each recommendation

Recommendation	Wholly Achieved	Partly Achieved	Not achieved	Action
<b>Central Government</b>				
1. We want Government and the agencies and bodies that it funds and sponsors to adopt and implement a centrally co-ordinated, long-term strategy for the provision of public education about sustainable development on the basis of advice from our Panel. (First Report, para 35)		✓		Chapter 5 of <i>A Better Quality of Life</i> had already set out the elements of the Government's ESD policy. The Government asked the Panel for further advice on what a strategy might consist of and, in particular, how it might build on those elements.
2. We also want Government to use its influence to motivate the bodies we are challenging below, to act. (First Report, para 35)	✓			The Government has assisted the Panel whenever the Panel has asked for help to influence one of the bodies to which it has made specific recommendations.
3. As part of this, we want all Government papers and reports dealing with Sustainable Development to contain a section on education. (First Report, para 35)  Ministers should include a section on education and awareness raising for sustainable development in all policy documents, consultation papers, and reports dealing with sustainable development issues. (Third Report, para 16)	✓			The Government undertook to do so in all reports and papers dealing specifically with sustainable development.  Most departments now have strategies for raising awareness of sustainable development.
4. Ministers from all departments should address all the elements of sustainable development on all appropriate occasions in their speeches and publications and in the public awareness campaigns that they establish. (Third Report, para 14)		✓		Ministers have made many significant references to sustainable development and to its elements, including speeches made by the Prime Minister on 24 October 2000 and 6 March 2001. (See also 51 on policies)
5. Ministers should set up systems to identify, share and celebrate good practice, and to ensure that all departments are helped to reach the standard of the best as soon as practicable. (Third Report, para 15)	✓			The Government issued a policy maker's checklist, made available on the Cabinet Office's website and through departmental intranets. It is working to produce further guidance where necessary.
6. When Ministers establish and review the objectives of associated and funded bodies, they should require such agencies and non-departmental public bodies to develop the same awareness raising strategies; to refer to sustainable development in announcements and campaigns; and to consider ESD in policy development as they have commended to their own departments. (Third Report, para 17)		✓		Many associated bodies have developed awareness raising strategies, and have sustainable development in their aims and directions.
7. Ministers should also require agencies and non-departmental public bodies to consider their wider role in education for sustainable development. (Third Report, para 18)		✓		Many associated bodies now do so.

Table 2: Action taken on each recommendation (continued)

Recommendation	Wholly Achieved	Partly Achieved	Not achieved	Action
<b>Local Government</b>				
<p>8. That Government endorses the work undertaken by the Local Government Management Board (LGMB) on integrating sustainable development into Best Value and that the sustainable development aspects of Best Value be monitored and evaluated by the LGMB and its successor bodies. (First Report, para 36)</p> <p>Local authorities should work in partnership with schools on Best Value and Community Strategies, thereby supporting schools further in becoming sustainable institutions, for example by provision of appropriate governor training. (Third Report, para. 38)</p>		✓		<p>Crosscutting issues, such as SD will be included in a census of councils during 2001/02 and 2005 about their approach to implementing best value, questioning Chief Executives, Best Value Officers and service heads, with repeat surveys of them in a sample of 100 authorities in intervening years. It is also carrying out case study and satellite studies, inspection reports, action plans etc., and qualitative interviews with local authority staff and other stakeholders.</p> <p>Any lessons will be generic for crosscutting issues as a whole e.g. good practice in conducting crosscutting reviews, rather than specific to sustainable development.</p> <p>See also response to recommendation 23</p>
<p>9. That Government implement the duty proposed in 'Modern Local Government: In Touch with the People' on local authorities to promote economic, social and environmental well being of their areas. (First Report, para 36)</p>	✓			Achieved in Local Government Act 2000.
<p>10. Ministers should set in train systems to monitor the public awareness aspects of the new duties and powers of the Local Government Act. (Third Report, para 27)</p>	✓			This research is being commissioned.
<p>11. Ministers should establish a regional resource, for example a centre of excellence, to encourage ESD strategy development and implementation at a regional level. (Third Report, para 28)</p>		✓		The RDAs are currently working with their partners on establishing Regional Centres of Excellence that will promote regional innovation and good practice, co-ordinating urban development training and encouraging community involvement in the regeneration process. The Government will consider what lessons can be learnt from this and applied to ESD.
<p>12. All RDAs should develop strategies for ESD as an integral part of overall plans taking full account of existing good practice and local response to nationally led developments such as ESD in the National Curriculum. (Third Report, para 29)</p>		✓		RDAs have produced strategies that take account of the needs for sustainable development. Some of these specifically refer to education.
<p>13. Local government planning authorities to ensure their lay members are trained in sustainable development and its implications. (First Report, para 36)</p>		✓		In May 1999 DETR, the Local Government Association, Royal Town Planning Association and the Improvement and Development Agency published <i>Training in Planning for Councillors</i> , giving guidance to planning authorities on councillor training. Modules help to illustrate the contribution of the planning system to delivering sustainable development. Many local authorities are now taking steps to provide appropriate training for councillors.

Table 2: Action taken on each recommendation (*continued*)

Recommendation	Action			
	Wholly Achieved	Partly Achieved	Not achieved	
<b>Schools</b>				
14. That Government incorporates ESD within the aims and purposes of the revised school curriculum and adopts measures to ensure that all pupils have an entitlement to education for sustainable development within the school curriculum. (First Report, para 37)	✓			Achieved in the National Curriculum changes.
15. That Government monitors the outcomes of education for sustainable development, in terms of knowledge, understanding, attitudes and behaviour. (First Report, para 37)			✓	<i>Quality of Life</i> indicator T8 suggests one way that this might be taken forward.
16. That Government... gives Governing Bodies explicit responsibility for the provision of education for sustainable development. (First Report, para 37)		✓		The National Curriculum already provides a statutory framework for ESD. Government also recognises need for additional guidance – the web-based guidance Ministers commissioned from QCA will offer additional support for teachers, governors and others.
17. Both DfEE and DETR (now DfES and DEFRA) should create more support and guidance for ESD, on a similar scale to that provided for other initiatives like Healthy Schools and Citizenship. (Third Report, para 34)		✓		Web-based guidance available and being further developed to include continuing professional development, school/buildings management and other issues. While this is well short of the scale of support provided for the other initiatives, they also contain SD content.
18. Ministers should consider how the professional needs of teachers and schools in this area can best be met. (Third Report, para 34)  QCA should be asked to propose (a) how the support and development needs of teachers can be met. (Third Report, para 35)		✓		TTA is currently consulting on Standards for Qualified Teacher Status and the requirements for initial teacher training. TTA has met Panel representatives and asked for their views. The web-based guidance and the Growing Schools and Food in Schools initiatives will offer further resources for teachers.
19. Ministers should establish a requirement that all schools to have a policy on sustainable development, covering both pupils' learning – through the school curriculum and extra curricular activities – and the sustainability of the school as an institution. (Third Report, para 34)  QCA should be asked to propose... (b) how schools can be encouraged to become sustainable institutions. (Third Report, para 35)		✓		National Curriculum already provides a statutory framework for ESD. DfES and other organisations including non-governmental organisations offer wide range of guidance on sustainability. These include DfES publications on the environmental design of schools, the Environmental Assessment Method and acoustic, lighting, thermal performance and energy targets. The web-based guidance on ESD will include buildings management.  The website will be developed further to include school buildings management.
20. DfEE should issue a circular on schools as sustainable institutions. (Third Report, para 34)			✓	As there are already many well-developed initiatives in this area, Ministers have no present plans to issue a circular. (See the rest of this section)

**Table 2: Action taken on each recommendation (continued)**

Recommendation	Wholly Achieved	Partly Achieved	Not achieved	Action
<b>Schools (continued)</b>				
21. OFSTED should include education for sustainable development in its inspection framework for monitoring and reviewing the work of schools. (First Report, para.37a)			✓	OFSTED will inspect and report on ESD where they encounter it.
22. OFSTED should carry out a focused investigation of ESD in schools as one of its regular sequence of investigations, assessing to what extent schools are implementing the new requirements and identifying good practice. (Third Report, para 37b)		✓		Ministers agree that a report based on inspection evidence would be helpful, and will consider this for Ofsted's 2001-2002 programme.
<p>23. The TTA, other training bodies and LEAs should incorporate ESD into all initial teacher training – and training of nursery staff and child minders – and all continuing professional development and governor training, where appropriate; and that LEAs should give encouragement and support to schools to conduct all their activities sustainably. (First Report, para 37d)</p> <p>The TTA, the General Teaching Council and OFSTED should make ESD a more significant element in initial and continuing teacher training and the schools monitoring framework. We also envisage important contributions by such agencies as Countryside and the Environment Agencies, English Nature, and English Heritage. (Third Report, para 36)</p> <p>The TTA should include ESD criteria within its teaching standards and OFSTED should establish whether teachers both meet these standards and receive sufficient training and support. (Third Report, para. 59)</p> <p>The TTA includes a sustainable development learning requirement in teacher training standards guidance and that a similar requirement be included in all Institute of Teaching and Learning programmes. (First Report, para. 39c)</p>		✓		<p>Several standards relevant to ESD are included in the TTA's current review of the Standards for Qualified Teacher Status. The TTA Handbook for teacher trainees which will accompany the revised Standards will include ESD guidance.</p> <p>QCA will consider the need for additional support and guidance for teachers during the development of the website and as part of its work with teachers and subject associations.</p> <p>The Early Years Development and Child Care Partnerships and local LSCs and councils are responsible for strategic planning to meet the training needs of child care and playwork practitioners. The Government has set national targets for the level of qualifications to be achieved by 2004: the LSC's target is to help 230,000 young people and sector workers to gain qualifications by 2004.</p> <p>School governors' training is provided by local authorities and will vary. The Panel has been asked to provide information which local authorities could use in training.</p> <p>Many organisations already work with local authorities, schools and the community on ESD schemes. The Panel has been asked to take this forward with a sample of local authorities with a view to disseminating good practice.</p>
24. The QCA should incorporate ESD, as appropriate, in the criteria governing all qualifications in the National Qualifications Framework. (Third Report, para. 39)		✓		Ministers will ask QCA to consider this when it next reviews its accreditation arrangements. The current criteria include reference to environmental issues.

Table 2: Action taken on each recommendation (*continued*)

Recommendation	Wholly Achieved	Partly Achieved	Not achieved	Action
<b>Further and Higher Education</b>				
25. Ministers should provide pump-priming funding to encourage HE institutions in collaboration with appropriate professional bodies to integrate sustainable development learning elements into tourism education and training programmes. (Third Report, para 56)			✓	Panel is discussing integration of ESD into Higher Education tourism courses with DCMS.
26. The Government should support our efforts to ensure that ESD criteria are integrated into FENTO standards; and into the QCA 's vocational GCSE qualifications criteria and the new technical certificate. (Third Report, para. 46)  FENTO should incorporate sustainable development criteria into all its standards. (Third Report, para. 49)  QCA should undertake a review of all occupational standards to assess whether core sustainable development competences are included, and that it includes sustainable development education criteria in vocational GCSE qualifications' criteria and the new technical certificate. (Third Report, para. 48)		✓		Government will ask QCA to give advice to NTOs and their successors on integrating ESD into the National Occupational Standards; and will ask QCA to consider the introduction of ESD requirements for the vocational GCSE qualifications and technical certificate at the next review.
27. The Government should require the LSC and the lifelong learning partnerships to outline their policies for ESD and to identify the arrangements they are making to secure it. (Third report, para. 47)	✓			The Government gave LSC clear strategic ESD objectives, and also issued guidance for board members of public bodies, which includes SD issues. LSC still in early stages of development and will need time and support to develop its ability to respond.
28. The establishment by Universities UK of a sustainable development sub-group to identify and help create incentives for academics to integrate appropriate sustainability learning into their HE programmes. (Third Report, para. 57)  Government funds a major <i>Sustainable Development in Further and Higher Education</i> initiative, modelled on the 'Enterprise in Higher Education' initiative. (First Report, para. 39a)	✓			A 3-year, £1m, UK-wide initiative, the Higher Education Partnership for Sustainability, began in 2000. Funded by the HEFCs for England, Scotland, Wales and Northern Ireland. Curriculum Development is an integral part of the initiative.
29. The development by the Association of MBAs of a strategy for integrating sustainability learning elements into MBA programmes. (Third Report, para. 58)			✓	The Panel needs to bring this recommendation to the attention of the Association of MBAs, or perhaps take it forward in some other way, such as through the development of generic briefing material, as for the professions, or in association with ACBE.
30. Further and Higher Education Funding Councils set sustainable development performance targets relating to significant sustainable development impacts and monitor and report on the progress towards those targets. (First Report, para. 39b)		✓		The LSC will build on work undertaken by the FEFC. Panel has published sustainability guide for FE. See also 31 below.

Table 2: Action taken on each recommendation (continued)

Recommendation	Wholly Achieved	Partly Achieved	Not achieved	Action
<b>Further and Higher Education</b>				
31. Local LSCs should fund the development of innovative sustainable development training programmes for the local business community, to improve the sustainable development competence of the local workforce; and for local citizens, to facilitate social inclusion and active participation in sustainable development. (Third Report, para. 50)  Principals, senior management teams and governing bodies should include a commitment to ESD within the Mission Statement of their organisation, and set targets for colleges' achievement of local economic environmental and social inclusion strategies within their strategic plans. (Third Report, para. 53)		✓		The LSC will provide a broad range of learning opportunities designed to help people become actively engaged in ESD activity, including neighbourhood management, asset building and community enterprise.  See also 30 above
32. The NTO National Council should assist NTOs to develop a strategic approach to integrating ESD into their vocational training programmes. (Third Report, para. 51)		✓		DfES have announced an advisory role on sustainable development for the new Sector Skills Development Agency.
33. learndirect should develop a set of sustainable development criteria that all its programmes have to meet. (Third Report, para. 52)		✓		The Panel needs to bring this to the attention of learndirect.
<b>Professions</b>				
34. The Government should support a major promotion of the contribution of the professions to sustainable development and to the development of a national plan to raise the skills base for sustainable urban development. (Third Report, para. 63)			✓	The Commission for Architecture and the Built Environment, sponsored by DCMS, will be a major driver in this area. The Panel's meeting with DCMS Ministers will set the agenda for what has to happen next.
35. A consortium of NGOs should develop a Sustainability Talks tape covering the core sustainability learning agenda for the professions, involving national experts and expert communicators. (Third Report, para. 64)		✓		Whilst no organisation has been asked to, or has offered to assume, responsibility for taking this specific recommendation forward, the Professional Practice for Sustainable Development programme has produced a Foundation Course in sustainable development for Professionals, which is attracting a great deal of interest. This has been achieved via a partnership of 14 professional institutions, non-governmental organisations and a Government Agency.
36. Those professional institutions with specific environment or sustainable development remits should work together to explore the desirability of establishing a sustainable development profession. (Third Report, para. 65)		✓		A number of professional bodies, together with NGOs such as Sustainability First, are developing this agenda.

Table 2: Action taken on each recommendation (continued)

Recommendation	Wholly Achieved	Partly Achieved	Not achieved	Action
<b>Professions (continued)</b>				
37. A consortium of sustainable development information, training and advice providers should develop a comprehensive support service for individual professionals who have significant sustainable development responsibilities. (Third Report, para. 66)			✓	No organisation has been asked to, or has offered to assume, responsibility for taking this forward.
38. The Panel would like to see a consortium of professional institutions from the financial sector and appropriate sustainable development organisations identify relevant sustainability learning criteria for the range of finance sector professionals. (Third Report, para. 67)		✓		ACBE's guidance for pension fund managers, investment analysts and trustees – Better Returns – should go some way to help promote this understanding.
<b>Workplace</b>				
39. That Government commissions work to create a liSD scheme and identify pilot companies. (First Report, para. 40a)	✓			Government commissioned a Panel study which recommended that this does not go ahead.
40. That Ufi adopt ESD principles in its work; plays a substantial role in any national programme for educating business and industry about sustainable development; plays a lead role in enabling employers and employees to educate each other about sustainable development; and does not give any course accreditation unless it includes defined sustainable development learning elements. (First Report, para 40b)	✓			Following consultation with its subject advisory panel on environmental services, Ufi is developing three learndirect on-line courses to encourage understanding of sustainable development for public and private sector organisations. These are: Sustainable development for all; Your Business and the Environment; and Farm Sustainability. Each course is delivered online and will become available to learners in the New Year. Farm Sustainability will be distributed via the Ufi hub for landbased industries, LANTRA.
41. That the Trades Unions Congress (TUC) ensures that subsequent phases of the Trade Union funding programme reflect education for sustainable development; and the Adult and Community Learning Fund be asked explicitly to promote education for sustainable development initiatives in its next round of grants. (First Report, para. 40c)			✓	This recommendation needs to be pursued further with the organisations tasked with taking it forward, which are not currently aware of it.
42. That the Confederation of British Industry (CBI), Federation of Small Businesses(FSB), Institute of Directors (IoD) and other appropriate business organisations be asked to adopt ESD principles. (First Report, para. 40d)			✓	This recommendation needs to be pursued further with the organisations tasked with taking it forward, which are not currently aware of it.
43. That the Department for Trade and Industry (DTI), DfES, CBI, FSB, IoD and TUC promote the negotiation of work place agreements about sustainable development. (First Report, para 40e)			✓	This recommendation needs to be pursued further with the organisations tasked with taking it forward, which are not currently aware of it.

Table 2: Action taken on each recommendation (continued)

Recommendation	Wholly Achieved	Partly Achieved	Not achieved	Action
<b>Youth Services</b>				
44. A partnership of Government and appropriate bodies from the sector to define specific learning outcomes unique to ESD and give encouragement and support to Local Authority Youth Services and National Voluntary Youth Organisations to enable them to conduct all their activities sustainably. (First Report, para. 38a)		✓		A Youth Service consultation document <i>Transforming Youth Work</i> was launched in March 2001. The document underlined the Government's support for the concept of youth development and outlined the future role of youth work and youth services set within the context of the Connexions Service, is providing co-ordinated support for 13-19 year olds. The consultation period for this document ended on 31 July 2001. The Government hopes to announce their response to <i>Transforming Youth Work</i> very soon and intends to develop a high quality youth work curriculum with clear outputs and achievements for young people.
45. The DfEE (now DfES) should champion the distinctive contribution youth work makes to sustainable development for individuals and communities and strengthen the use of the Standards Fund and its grant scheme to National Voluntary Youth Organisations to embed more consistent approaches to sustainable development and improve the skills of youth work practitioners. (Third Report, para 77)	✓			Sustainable development will be included in the Youth Service Curriculum. Also, in May 2001, the Secretary of State for Education and Employment announced a new £20 million Youth Service Standards Fund. The new fund will boost the capacity of the Youth Service to provide young people with a wide range of personal development opportunities, and will raise the standards of youth work across the country. Guidance for applying for this fund will be announced very soon.
46. The NYA to ensure that ESD is incorporated into all initial Local Authority Youth Services and National Voluntary Youth Organisations training by including it as one of the criteria for endorsement. (First Report, para 38b)		✓		Achieved for local authority, sector and initial professional training.
47. All youth providing bodies monitored by the OFSTED to monitor the outcomes of education for sustainable development, both in terms of knowledge, understanding, attitudes and behaviour. (First Report, para 38c)	✓			OFSTED inspect local authority Youth Services and National Voluntary Youth Organisations and will pick out sustainable development on these inspections. OFSTED have recently revised their inspection framework <i>Inspecting Youth Work</i> and also produced a <i>Self-Assessment Schedule for Youth Work</i> , to be used as an inspection tool which is completed by the Youth Service in advance of an inspection.

Table 2: Action taken on each recommendation (continued)

Recommendation	Wholly Achieved	Partly Achieved	Not achieved	Action
<b>General Public</b>				
48. That Government fund <i>Are You Doing Your Bit?</i> (and any successor campaigns) at at least the level and consistency of the road safety campaign. (First Report, para 41a)			✓	<i>Are You Doing Your Bit?</i> is currently under review following the creation of DEFRA.
49. That Government conduct a benchmark survey for public/households on understanding of the need to live sustainably; understanding of how individual behaviour impacts on sustainable development; and ability to change behaviour to live more sustainably. (First Report, para 41d)	✓			Government is currently analysing the responses to a benchmark public attitude survey.
50. That the Government ensure that the requirements on the five terrestrial channels, the BBC's Charter, and the Independent Television Commission require them to include ESD programming wherever appropriate, be it in educational programmes, documentaries or within news and current affairs; and that they, and the national and regional newspapers, report annually on their contribution to promoting sustainable development learning; and that the five major terrestrial channels and national and regional newspapers regularly report indicators for sustainable development. (First Report, para.41e)			✓	The Panel intends to follow this up itself with DCMS Ministers.
51. Ministers from DETR and DfEE (Now DEFRA and DfES) should explore with Ministers and officials of DCMS how they can best promote ESD both through their own policies, and through the many bodies that they sponsor. (Third Report, para 83)			✓	Ministers awaiting Panel meeting with DCMS Ministers.
52. All major engagements points e.g. retail outlets, petrol stations, post offices, utilities, leisure services, libraries etc. provide <i>Are You Doing Your Bit?</i> information. (First Report, para. 41b)			✓	<i>Are You Doing Your Bit?</i> is currently under review following the creation of DEFRA.
53. All community leaders identify their role in promoting ESD. (First Report, para. 41c)			✓	Not clear whose initiative it would be to take this forward, though work on local community strategies may help to do so.
54. The Arts Council, The Sports Council and Resource should ensure that their policies and action plans promote fully the potential for education in sustainable development in their respective areas. (Third Report, para. 85)		✓		The Panel intends to follow this up itself with DCMS Ministers. DCMS's directions require the Arts Council and Sport England (successor to the Sports Council) to have regard to the need to further the objectives of sustainable development in allocating Lottery funding.
55. The BBC, the independent broadcasting sector, and national newspapers should give high profile coverage to sustainable development issues both as part of news and current affairs items, and as part of more specialist pieces. (Third Report, para. 86)		✓		There has been some good coverage, such as the 2000 Reith Lectures. Much has been at times of disaster such as flooding and foot-and-mouth disease.

## APPENDIX C

# About the Sustainable Development Education Panel

## Function of Body

On 27 February 1998 the Deputy Prime Minister and the Secretary of State for Education and Employment set up an advisory panel of sustainable development education experts, made up of members of business, local government, education and voluntary sectors. Its terms of reference are to work together to identify gaps, opportunities, priorities and partnerships for action in providing sustainable development education in England, and to highlight good practice.

The Panel has 22 members at present, has held 40 meetings to date, and has established subgroups looking at Schools, Work and the Professions, Lifelong Learning, and Developing a Template for ESD sector guides. The Panel has formally submitted its first (1998), Second (1999), Third (2000) and Fourth (2001) Annual Reports to the Government, and made representations in respect of Government consultations, notably the Qualifications and Assessment Authority's review of the National Curriculum and DfES's of National Training Organisations. The Panel has also commissioned consultancy work providing information and developing ideas to take forward its strategy. Its secretariat is provided jointly by the DEFRA and DfES.

## Present Membership

### CHAIR

**Sir Geoffrey Holland**, Vice Chancellor of Exeter University, appointed February 1998

**Mrs. Jennifer Adshead**, Director of Education and Training, National Federation of Women's Institutes and Denman College, appointed February 2001

**Mr. Roy Atkinson**, Independent Consultant, former Director of Education, appointed February 1998

**Ms. Heather Barrett-Mold**, Vice Principal, Southgate College, appointed February 1998

**Mr. John Baumber**, Rivington & Blackrod High School, appointed February 2001

**Dr Douglas Bourn**, Director, Development Education Association, appointed February 1998

**Sir Neil Chalmers**, Director, Natural History Museum, appointed April 1998

**Ms. Donna Clarke**, Greenergy International, Group, appointed June 2000

**Mr. Ken Davies**, Director of Learning through Landscapes, appointed February 2001

**Mrs. Claire Foster**, Church of England Board for Social Responsibility, appointed February 2001

**Ms. Rosemary Gray**, Principal and Chief Executive, Walsall College of Arts and Technology, appointed February 1998

**Ms. Libby Grundy**, Director, Council for Environmental Education, appointed February 1998

**Ms. Annie Hall**, Head of Education at Environment Agency, appointed February 2001

**Mr. Michael Knapp**, Independent Consultant, appointed February 1998

**Mr. Bill Lucas**, Chief Executive, Campaign for Learning, appointed February 1998

**Dr Gordon McGlone**, Director of Lantra, Chief Executive of Gloucestershire Wildlife Trust, appointed February 2001

**Mr. Peter Martin**, Head of Education, WWF UK, appointed February 1998

**Ms. Jyoti Munsiff**, Company Secretary, Shell Transport Trading Company, appointed June 2000

**Professor Audrey Osler**, Director of the Centre for Citizenship Studies at the University of Leicester, appointed February 2001

**Mr. Gareth Richards**, Education Department of the Transport & General Workers Union, appointed February 2001

**Mr. John Westaway**, Principal Subject Officer for Geography, Qualifications and Curriculum Authority, appointed February 1998

**Mr. Tom Wylie**, Chief Executive, National Youth Agency, appointed February 1998

## Appointments

The Panel is due to be reviewed in 2002 and new appointments will depend on the outcome of that review. It is unlikely that any new appointments will be made prior to February 2003.

## Terms of Reference

### AIM

To consider issues on education for sustainable development, in its broadest sense, in schools, further and higher education, at work, during recreation and at home; and to make practical recommendations for action in England. The Panel reports directly to the Secretaries of State for Education and Skills and for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs.

### OBJECTIVES

1. To promote a strategic approach to sustainable development education in England;
2. To identify gaps and opportunities in the provision of sustainable development education and consider how to improve that provision;
3. To promote an approach which will reduce duplication, increase co-operation and develop synergy between all sectors and groups involved;
4. To consider whether and what targets should be set for various sectors;
5. To highlight best practice and consider the means of disseminating it more widely;
6. To make recommendations to key stakeholders on priority areas for action;
7. To assess the effectiveness of this approach.

### OUTPUT

An annual report to the Secretaries of State for Education and Skills and for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs, setting out recommendations, where appropriate, for action by Government, the Panel and other key players.

### FURTHER INFORMATION

Panel minutes and other documents are published on the Panel’s website at <http://www.defra.gov.uk/environment/sustainable/educpanel/index.htm>

### CONTACT DETAILS

Mr Richard Mabbitt	Ms Cheryl Chamberlin
Zone 6/G9	The Westminster Suite
Ashdown House	Caxton House
123 Victoria Street	Tothill Street
London SW1E 0DE	London SW1H 9NA
Phone 020 7944 6694	Phone: 020 7273 5193
Fax: 020 7944 6559	Fax: 020 7273 5004
E-mail: richard.mabbitt@defra.gsi.gov.uk	E-mail: cheryl.chamberlin@dfes.gsi.gov.uk

**DEFRA**

Department for  
**Environment,  
Food & Rural Affairs**